BASELINE STUDY OF ASHSHASH II: MEN AND WOMEN WHO HAVE ESCAPED TRAFFICKING



Prepared for



Prepared by

Abul Barkat Matiur Rahman, Rowshan Ara Asmar Osman, Faisal M Ahamed, Md. Aminur Rahman





www.hdrc-bd.com



info@hdrc-bd.com +88 017 0074 3020

Baseline Study of Ashshash II: Men and Women Who Have Escaped Trafficking

Submitted to



House 45, Road 07, Block-F, Banani, Dhaka-1213, Bangladesh

Submitted by

Abul Barkat¹
Matiur Rahman², Rowshan Ara³
Asmar Osman⁴, Faisal M Ahamed⁵, Md. Aminur Rahman⁶



Dhaka: December 2024

¹ Advisor of this Assignment and Chief Advisor, HDRC

² Team Leader of this Assignment, and Sr. Research Consultant, HDRC

³ Gender Expert of this Assignment, and Sr. Research Consultant, HDRC

⁴ Migration & Human Trafficking Expert of this Assignment, and Research Consultant, HDRC

⁵ Statistician and Director of Research, HDRC

⁶ Research Consultant, HDRC

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abbreviation				
Executive Summary				
Chapter	1: Introduction	14		
1.1	Ashshash II Project Overview	14		
1.2	Objectives of the Assignment	18		
1.3	Key Indicators, Research Questions and Methods of Measurement	18		
Section 2: Approach and Methodology				
2.1	Research Approach	21		
2.2	Types of Respondents	21		
2.3	Data Collection Methods	21		
Chapter:	3: Literature Review Outcomes	25		
3.1	Introduction	25		
3.2	Root Causes of Human Trafficking	26		
3.3 Tra	afficking Source and Destination Countries	28		
3.4	Exploitation Types and Vulnerabilities of Victims	30		
3.5	Migration in Context of Trafficking	31		
3.6	Economic empowerment	32		
3.7	Social Integration for Trafficking Survivors	33		
3.8	Social Stigma and Human Trafficking	33		
3.9	Psychological Support for Trafficking Survivors	33		
3.10	Skill Development for Victims of Human Trafficking	33		
3.11	Gender Equity and Social Inclusion (GESI)	34		
3.12	Prevention and Suppression of Human Trafficking Global Frameworks on Human			
Trafficking34				
Chapter	4: Conceptual Aspect of Human Trafficking	39		
4.1	Situation of Human Trafficking	39		
4.2	Definition of Trafficking in Person and Human Trafficking	39		
4.3	Definition of Harassment	40		
4.4	Definition of Sexual Harassment	40		
4.5	Definition: Gender-based violence	40		
Chapter 5: Analysis of Survey Findings4				
5.1	Analysis of Survey Findings of Quantitative Data Overview of Quantitative Analysis	42		
5.1.1	Demographic Information of Trafficking Survivors	42		
5.1.2	Household Demographics	44		
5.1.4	Recruitment and Employment Scenarios	51		
5.1.5	Scenarios of Exploitations	53		
5.1.6	Well-being Status of Trafficking Survivors	54		
5.1.7 S	ocio-economic Reintegration	58		
5.1.8	Earning Status of the Trafficking Survivors	59		
5.1.9	Employment Opportunity for Trafficking Survivors	60		
5.1.10	Family Support for the Trafficking Survivors	62		
5.1.11	Force Migration Due to Natural Disaster	63		
5.1.12	Access to Justice for the Trafficking Survivors	64		
5.1.13	Access to Necessary Supports after being subject to SGBV	66		
5.1.14	Access to Holistic Care for the Trafficking Survivors			
5.1.15	Access to Psychosocial Counselling and Referral Mechanism	69		
5.1.16	Access to Training and Resources			
5.1.17	Enrolment Status of the Trafficking Survivors in Vocational/skills Training	70		
5.1.18	Access to Financial Support	72		
5.1.19	Information from the Civil Society for Awareness	73		

C.i.aptc.	7. Concusion and Neconincinations	
Chapter	7: Conclusion and Recommendations	94
Chapter 6: Potential Challenges and Suggested Remedies		
5.4.	Plausible Effective Strategies and Implementation Priorities	86
5.3	6	
	Analysis of Survey Findings Obtained through Qualitative Tools	77
5.1.2.	1 Awareness about Human Trafficking	76
	O Participation in Community Decision Making Process	
	·	

Annexes

- Annex 1: Baseline Survey Findings at a Glance
- Annex 2: List of Documents Reviewed
- Annex 3: Baseline Survey Findings at a Glance
- Annex 4: Assessment of Ashshash Phase II Logical Framework
- Annex 5: Annex Tables
- Annex 6: Quantitative Survey Questionnaire
- Annex 7: Qualitative Guidelines
- Annex 8: Study Team

Abbreviation

APP Awareness and Prevention Partner
BDS Business Development Support

BMET Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training

BTEB Bangladesh Technical Education Board CBO Community Based Organizations

CBT Class Based Training CM Case Manager

CSO Civil Society Organisation
CSR Corporate Social Responsibility
CTC Counter-Trafficking Committee
CTIP Counter-Trafficking in Persons
DLAC District Legal Aid Committee

EDT Entrepreneurship Development Training

FGD Focus Group Discussion

GESI Gender Equality and Social Inclusion

GLO.ACT Global Action Against Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling of Migrants in

Bangladesh

GOB Government of Bangladesh

GVA Gender and Vulnerability Assessment

HH Household

IBT Industry-Based Training
IDI In-depth Interview

IGA Income Generating Activities
ILO International Labour Organization

INGO International Non-Government Organisation IOM International Organization for Migration

KII Key Informant Interview
LNOB Leave No One Behind
M&E Monitoring and Evaluation
MBT Mentor-mentee Based Training
MEL Monitoring, Evaluation, Learning

MERL Monitoring, Evaluation, Research, & Learning

MFI Microfinance Institution

MOEWOE Ministry of Expatriates' Welfare and Overseas Employment

MOHA Ministry of Home Affairs

MSME Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises

NGO Non-governmental Organisation

NHTPF National Human Trafficking Prevention Fund

NPA National Plan of Action
NRM National Referral Mechanism

NTVQF National Technical and Vocational Qualification Framework

OCC One Stop Crisis Centre
PSE Private Sector Engagement
PWD Person with Disability

PSHTA Prevention and Suppression of Human Trafficking Act

RMG Ready-Made Garments

SDC Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation

SDG Sustainable Development Goals
SGBV Sexual and Gender-based Violence

SME Small and Medium Sized Enterprise

SSC Secondary School Certificate
SOP Standard Operating Procedures
SPP Social Protection Provider

SRP Sustainable Reintegration Partner

TIP Trafficking in person
TOT Training of Trainers
TSP Training Service Providers
TTC Technical Training Centre

TVET Technical and Vocational Education and Training

UHC Upazila Health Centre

UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNO Upazila Nirbahi Officer

UNODC United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime

UP Union Parishad

USAID United States Agency for International Development

UzLAC Upazila Legal Aid Committee
VCMS Victim Case Management System

VoT Victims of Trafficking

Executive Summary

The geographical location of Bangladesh makes it a strategically important country. Being burdened with a huge human population, Bangladesh confronts a complex and multifaceted issue of Trafficking in Persons (TIP). Bangladesh is faced with tremendous challenges in combating and preventing trafficking. For the last three years, Bangladesh had been placed in Tier 2 as part of the US State Department watch list for TIP in June 2020.

Bangladesh is considered a source and transit country for men, women, and children who are trafficked. A significant share of Bangladesh's trafficking victims are men who are fraudulently recruited for overseas work. Trafficking also includes the trafficking of children – both boys and girls – within Bangladesh for commercial sexual exploitation, bonded labour, and forced labour. Through fraud and physical coercion, some children are sold into bondage by their parents, while others are induced into labour or commercial sexual exploitation.

Bangladeshi men and women migrate willingly to different countries, mostly under legal and contractual terms. Such Bangladeshis seeking overseas employment through legal channels rely on the 724 recruiting agencies that belong to the Bangladesh Association of International Recruiting Agencies (BAIRA). These agencies are legally permitted to charge workers up to a certain amount. NGOs report many Bangladeshi migrant laborers are victims of recruitment fraud, including exorbitant recruitment fees often accompanied by a fraudulent representation of terms of employment. The International Labour Organization (ILO) has concluded high recruitment fees increase vulnerability to forced labour among transnational migrant workers. Women typically work as domestic servants; some find themselves in situations of forced labour or debt bondage where they face restrictions on their movements, non-payment of wages, threats, and physical abuse or sexual abuse. Some Bangladeshi women working abroad are subsequently trafficked into commercial sexual exploitation. Bangladeshi children and adults are also trafficked internally for commercial sexual exploitation, domestic servitude, and bonded labour.

Bangladesh does not fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking; however, it is making significant efforts to do so. The government has continued to address the sex trafficking of women and children. Despite these significant efforts, the government did not demonstrate evidence of increased efforts to prosecute and convict labour trafficking offenders, particularly those responsible for the fraudulent recruitment of Bangladeshi workers for the purpose of forced labour overseas. Several NGOs reported a nexus among members of parliament and corrupt recruiting agencies and village-level brokers and indicated that politicians and regional gangs were involved in human trafficking.

The Government of Bangladesh, in collaboration with NGOs and INGOs, put efforts to rehabilitate survivors of trafficking. One such attempt is Ashshash. 'Ashshash: For Men and Women Who Have Escaped Trafficking' Phase II is a four-year program funded by the Embassy of Switzerland in Bangladesh and implemented by Winrock International in partnership with local NGOs. Ashshash II follows the completion of Ashshash Phase I, which was implemented from June 2018 to May 2023 across five vulnerable trafficking-prone districts in Bangladesh. Phase II is scheduled to conclude in May 2027. The main focus of Ashshash II lies in the sustainable psychosocial and economic reintegration of survivors, with a specific emphasis on women, who constitute 65% of the overall target population. This program seeks to achieve this goal through comprehensive psychosocial support, promoting climate-resilient alternative livelihoods, facilitating the development of microsmall enterprises, and creating employment opportunities in collaboration with the private sector. The primary objective is to enable women and men who have escaped trafficking to restore their

dignity, well-being, and self-sufficiency. Over the course of four years, Ashshash II will provide a comprehensive and tailored package of services to trafficking survivors, closely collaborating with various stakeholders, including Sustainable Reintegration Partners (SRPs), Business Development Services(BDS) partners, Awareness & Prevention Partners (APPs), private sector entities, and strategic network partners. Key SRP services will encompass survivor identification case management. In addition to supporting survivors, Ashshash II will work on raising awareness and preventing trafficking in at-risk communities by collaborating with APPs and Policy Advocacy Partners who possess expertise in community mobilization on trafficking. By providing survivors of trafficking with access to holistic care, skills training, and employment opportunities, the project aims to empower them mentally and physically.

Purpose of the Baseline Study

The principal objective of the baseline study is to establish a baseline value for key output, outcome, and impact indicators to serve as a benchmark for measuring impact and changes over time and at the end of the project. The baseline study will also look into contextual aspects of human trafficking in targeted districts, community and stakeholders' perception, and the well-being as well as socioeconomic reintegration of survivors.

Winrock International has entrusted HDRC to conduct such a rationally important baseline study, which HDRC has already completed. The present report is an outcome of the baseline study. The findings from the study are highly insightful and are expected to support Winrock and the program in developing a policy paper on the National Referral Mechanism. This initiative aims to foster a more cohesive and effective response to addressing human trafficking issues.

However, herein, we provide a snapshot of the study findings in terms of principal indicators in line with the issues covered in the survey.

A random sample of 504 trafficking survivors was selected and determined statistically with a 95% confidence level and a 5% margin of error to conduct this baseline survey. The sampling frame was provided by the Ashshash II Authority and comprised only project-supported survivors. The Ashshash II Authority developed a list of trafficking survivors in the enrollment process for the program, from which respondents were randomly selected for interviews.

Field-level survey data were collected using CAPI for the quantitative segment of the survey. Of this sample size, 65% are female. For qualitative counterparts, 12 Focus Group Discussions (FGDs), 44 Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) and 10 case studies were conducted with relevant respondent groups. Surveys could be easily conducted, and so is the case with respondents of FGDs, KIIs and case studies. FGDs were conducted with male and female trafficking survivors, including community men and women, while KIIs were approached by government and non-government stakeholders. A few male and female survivors were selected for case studies to gain in-depth insight.

The study findings have been accumulated based on a set of research questions set against impact, outcome and output indicators as adopted in the programme. Considering the indicators, this study investigated the personal profile of the trafficking survivors, family information, migration context and recruitment, exploitation experiences, well-being status of trafficking survivors, employment opportunities for trafficking survivors, access to holistic care for the trafficking survivors, access to justice, access to training and resources, status of family support for the trafficking survivors, access to financial support, income of trafficking survivors, and information from civil society for awareness. However, we provide salient features of the survey findings here. These study findings are aligned with the programme's objectives, outcome, and output indicators developed in the result framework.

However, the study has investigated basic and family information of the trafficking information, migration context, exploitation experience, and status of receiving comprehensive support like psychological counselling, health, shelter, and legal services. This study has also explored trafficking survivors' mental, physical, social, and economic well-being status, as this status is highly essential for their successful socioeconomic reintegration. Finally, this study has also depicted findings on their willingness to receive skill and vocational training and their access to information regarding human trafficking.

Personal Profile of Survivors: Demographic

The age distribution of trafficking survivors shows nuanced gender-based distinctions. Among male survivors, the 26-30 age group has the highest representation (29.9%), whereas for female survivors, the highest concentration is in the 36-40 age group (28.7%). The educational attainment among trafficking survivors reveals marked differences by sex. A notable 21.4% of female survivors can only read and write, compared to just 5.1% of male survivors. The number of children among trafficking survivors varies significantly by sex. A higher proportion of male survivors (19.9%) report having no children, compared to only 7.5% of female survivors. Female survivors are more likely to have two or more children, with 37% reporting two children and 21.4% having three, compared to 30.9% and 11% of male survivors, respectively.

Family Information of Trafficking Survivors

Almost 62% of the male trafficking survivors have five or more family members. In contrast, 43% of female survivors' families have the same size of family members. The average family member of our surveyed trafficking survivors is 4.68. The data on the number of dependent family members reveals gender-specific patterns. Male survivors more commonly report having three or more dependent family members (66%) compared to female survivors (47%). The distribution of earning members within households of trafficking survivors shows similar patterns across the sexes, with slight variations. Most male (55.4%) and female (51.1%) survivors report having only one earning member. The distribution of school-going children in the households of trafficking survivors reveals little difference by sex. Among male survivors, 41.2% report having no school-going children, slightly higher than the 37.3% reported by female survivors. The presence of persons with disabilities (PWDs) in the households of trafficking survivors is relatively uncommon, with minimal gender differences. Most male (94.9%) and female (95.4%) survivors report having no PWDs in their households. The proportion of households with one PWD is slightly higher among male survivors (5.1%) compared to female survivors (4.0%). Only 0.6% of female survivors report having two PWDs within their families.

The distribution of household heads among trafficking survivors shows visible gender-based variations. Over half of male survivors (53.7%) report being the household head themselves, whereas only 28.7% of female survivors hold this role. The analysis of household main income earners among trafficking survivors shows significant differences by sex. Most male survivors (63.8%) report being the main income earners in their households, while only 22.9% of female survivors claim this role. The analysis of household income among trafficking survivors indicates a pronounced economic disparity between the sexes. Most female survivors (74.9%) report a monthly household income below BDT 15,000, compared to 66.1% of male survivors. This reflects a broader trend of financial strain among female-headed households.

Migration Context and Recruitment

Financial need was one of the most motivational aspects for many of the trafficking survivors (86.3%), which was 87% for males, a little higher than the females (85.9%). Another mentionable factor for migration is brokers' provocation for nearly two-thirds (62.9%) of the trafficking survivors, while 70.6% of male and 58.7% of female survivors reported the same separately.

Nearly half (47.2%) of the trafficking survivors' destination country was Saudi Arabia, which was for more than half (56%) of the female and 31.1% of male survivors separately. Only a few (13.3%) trafficking survivors received employment contracts before migrating overseas. However, the number of male survivors (19.2%) who received employment contracts is nearly double that of female survivors (10.1%).

Exploitation Experiences

As per the discussion with both the male and female trafficking survivors, most of the survivors were either physically tortured or emotionally abused, and they were not permitted to go outside the home. The highly mentionable exploitations for the women were labour exploitation, emotional abuse, no work payment, physical harassment, and imprisonment in the room. Further, after returning home, other family members neither love them nor behave cordially. It is also noticeable that all the trafficking survivors are facing negative attitudes from their community members. Community members often avoid them and are not interested in inviting the survivors to any social functions and rituals.

Well-being Status of Trafficking Survivors

The percentage of survivors reporting positive mental well-being shows a slight gender difference. Female survivors indicate the highest percentage (21.84%), followed by the overall average (21.55%) and male survivors (21%). According to the FGD findings, most of the trafficking survivors are suffering from mental unrest because of their exploitation and failure to recover the cost and loan they took for going abroad.

Physical well-being percentages are quite close across gender lines, with male survivors at 7.56% and female survivors at 7.34%, resulting in an overall percentage of 7.42%. According to the FGD findings, most of the trafficking survivors became physically weak immediately after returning home as an effect of facing different forms of exploitation, especially no or less feeding, including physical abuse at the time of staying abroad.

Social well-being data reveals a notable difference between the sexes. Male survivors report a higher percentage (17.37%) than female survivors (16.01%), with an overall average of 16.49%. The FGD findings indicate that female trafficking survivors had faced highly negative attitudes from the community than male trafficking survivors.

Economic well-being presents the most pronounced difference between the sexes. Male survivors report a higher percentage (16.78%), while female survivors report only 13.82%, leading to an overall economic WB percentage of 14.86%. The FGD findings reveal that after returning home, trafficking survivors face economic hardship as they have no employment or earnings.

The analysis reveals gender-specific disparities in well-being, especially in the social and economic domains, where female survivors consistently report lower percentages than males. While mental and physical well-being is somewhat balanced, economic and social support programs need to be more gender-responsive. Enhancing economic opportunities and social inclusion for female survivors could improve their overall well-being. Comprehensive rehabilitation efforts should focus on bridging these gaps to support long-term recovery and integration.

Employment Opportunity for Trafficking Survivors

Only 49% of all trafficking survivors participated in income-generating activities. Among male survivors, 66.1% were engaged in such activities, a higher rate compared to just 39.8% of female survivors. While 66.1% of male survivors successfully transitioned into income-generating work, 33.9% have not yet secured new employment, many of whom continue to face difficulties accessing the job market. In contrast, only 39.8% of female survivors have found employment since their trafficking experience, with a larger proportion (60.2%) still without work, indicating more significant challenges for female survivors in achieving economic reintegration.

Access to Holistic Care for the Trafficking Survivors

None of the trafficking survivors, regardless of sex, reported receiving comprehensive, holistic care involving psychosocial counselling, legal support, and medical attention. One hundred percent of male survivors indicated they did not receive any form of holistic care. Among male survivors, none reported gaining access to such justice mechanisms, reflecting a stark 0% positive outcome, demonstrating a significant gap in providing justice-related support for this group. The survey reveals the percentage distribution of trafficking survivors who received medical, psychosocial, and legal support after being subjected to various forms of sexual and gender-based violence broken down by sex. The survey data analysis indicates that overall access to such psychosocial services remains notably low, with 98.4% of survivors reporting that they did not receive this type of counselling. Only 1.6% overall accessed this support. The baseline survey reveals that almost none of the trafficking survivors, regardless of sex, received training or resources to secure new or improved employment, reflecting a glaring gap in post-recovery support.

Access to Justice

Only 14% of the trafficking survivors reported filing a case against the trafficking traffickers, and it is also mentionable that 30% of the female trafficking survivors had filed these cases immediately after returning home. But no male trafficking survivors filed a case against their trafficking incidents. Along with this, a few (5.4%) of the trafficking survivors sought alternative judicial processes, and 4% of them were not aware of this process.

Access to Training and Resources

The baseline survey highlights that almost no trafficking survivors received training aimed at improving their employment prospects, with only a handful enrolling in new or better vocational skills development programs. The fact that the total number of individuals who received training was small (n = 8) shows the limited reach of current support initiatives and highlights an urgent need for expanded and inclusive training programs to support survivors' reintegration and economic empowerment.

Status of Family Support for the Trafficking Survivors

The baseline survey reveals that family support for trafficking survivors remains critically low, reflecting a notable gap in social and psychological reinforcement during their reintegration process. Only a minor proportion, less than 10% of survivors, reported receiving family support.

Access to Financial Support

The baseline survey highlights that almost no trafficking survivors were offered access to finance and increased market linkages aimed at improving their employment/entrepreneurial prospects. None of the trafficking survivors, regardless of sex, reported using any formal financial offers and services. 100% of male survivors indicated they could not use it. Similarly, 100% of female survivors reported

the same. As per the qualitative findings, most of the male and female trafficking survivors have no chance to have access to any financial institution from where they can take loans.

Income of Trafficking Survivors

Overall, the majority (71%) of our surveyed survivors earn less than 6,000 BDT per month, while this situation of income is worse among female (85.9%) than male (44.6%) survivors. It suggests that a large portion of our trafficking survivors are in financially vulnerable conditions. Only a few (4.6%) survivors earned exactly 6,000 BDT, but such income is only for 5.5% of females, a little higher than males (2.8%). It is also noticeable that overall, nearly one-fourth (24%) of the survivors earned more than 6,000 BDT, which is notably higher among the male (52.5%) than female survivors (8.6%).

It is also noticeable that the average income of the surveyed survivors is 3861.41 BDT. However, the data shows that the average income for males is 7275.42 BDT, which is notably higher than for females (2013.46 BDT), meaning that female survivors are more financially vulnerable than males.

Information from the Civil Society for Awareness

Nearly all trafficking survivors, regardless of gender, did not feel that they had been better informed or had more influence due to initiatives supported by civil society organizations or independent media. The vast majority of survivors were unaware of any such support mechanisms that might have empowered them. Only a tiny proportion of female survivors (just 0.3%) reported perceiving any positive impact from these civil society-driven efforts. This indicates that these initiatives have had minimal reach or effectiveness in enhancing their access to information or decision-making processes.

Limitations of the Baseline Study

The present baseline study has to be completed under two constraints, namely, time constraints and societal turmoil. In order to embody various dimensions of the lifestyle of the survivors, we had to construct a lengthy questionnaire for which the allotted time was inadequate. During the survey period, the effect of political unrest in the country persisted. This had physical as well as psychological impacts. Besides the above, one more limitation might be related to retrospective memory recall data. Although enumerators were very seriously instructed to remind the respondents to provide responses for the period prior to being enrolled in Ashshash II, we cannot be 100% sure that this happened in 100% of cases. In some cases, it might happen that some respondents in some cases provided current information.

General Discussion

From the baseline study findings, it is spectacularly clear that the vision and mission of the Ashshash II exactly match what most survey survivors desire and intend to have. For example, with a 95% likelihood or confidence level, 88.84%-93.76%, survivors in the population have expressed their willingness to have training for rehabilitating the survivors to normal life.

Recommendations

Survey results indicate that the Ashshash II faces significant hurdles and challenges in achieving its objectives. For instance, an extremely small proportion of survivors in the population—ranging from 0% to 0.59%—have ever received awareness about human trafficking. Similarly, there is a 95% likelihood that only 0.5% to 2.0% of survivors have accessed psychosocial counselling.

These findings highlight substantial areas for intervention under Ashshash II, suggesting ample scope for impactful work. However, careful and strategic implementation will be critical to address these challenges and effectively ensure the project's success.

To enhance and strengthen the capacity for target group involvement, it is essential to actively engage women in all activities. Awareness-building strategies can include door-to-door campaigns, cultural programs, essay writing and debate competitions, student training sessions (targeting schools and colleges), courtyard meetings, and orientations with local influencers such as elites, teachers, religious leaders, and transport workers. Additional approaches like wall magazines and other creative methods should be utilized to diversify awareness efforts.

Fostering community-level understanding is critical in combating human trafficking. Research by the Refugee and Migratory Movement Research Unit (RMMRU) under Ashshash II highlights that 5% of current migrants and 3.1% of returnee migrants experience blackmail or extortion in destination countries. Addressing these issues requires focused interventions that tackle the root causes of vulnerability, raise awareness, and provide comprehensive support services to affected individuals. RMMRU plans extensive awareness campaigns utilizing various tools and mediums, such as community radio programs, courtyard meetings, school-based programmes, wall painting, etc.